

International Law Studies—Volume 54
NATO Agreements on Status: Travaux Préparatoires
Joseph M. Snee (Editor)

The thoughts and opinions expressed are those of the authors and not necessarily of the U.S. Government,
the U.S. Department of the Navy or the Naval War College.

Parallel Table for Texts of SOFA 1

Final Text 6/19/1951	Brussels Stat. 12/21/ 1949	D-D(51) 23	MS-D (51)5	MS-D (51)9	MS-D (51)11	MS-D(51) 11(R)	MS-D(51) 11(2R)	D-D(51) 57	MS-D(51) 28	D-D(51) 127	D-D(51) 138
Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title
	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble
I, 1(a)	1(a), 1(d)	I(a)	I(a)	I(a)	I(a)	I(a)	I(a)	I(a)	I(a)	I, 1(a)	I, 1(a)
I, 1(b)		I(b)	I(b)	I(b)	I(b)	I(b)	I(b)	I(b)	I(b)	I, 1(b)	I, 1(b)
I, 1(c)		I(c)	I(c)	I(c)	I(c)	I(c)	I(c)	I(c)	I(c)	I, 1(c)	I, 1(c)
I, 1(d)	1(b)	I(d)	I(d)	I(d)	I(d)	I(d)	I(d)	I(d)	I(d)	I, 1(d)	I, 1(d)
I, 1(e)	1(c)	I(e)	I(e)	I(e)	I(e)	I(e)	I(e)	I(e)	I(e)	I, 1(e)	I, 1(e)
I, 1(f)		I(f)	I(f)	I(f)	I(f)	I(f)	I(f)	I(f)	I(f)	I, 1(f)	I, 1(f)
I, 1(g)									I(g)	I, 1(g)	I, 1(g)
I, 2										I, 2	I, 2
II	2										
III, 1	7(1)	VI, 1	VI, 3	II	II	II	II	II	II	II	II
III, 2	3(1)	II, 1	II, 1	III, 1	III, 1	III, 1	III, 1	III, 1	III, 1	III, 1	III, 1
III, 3	3(2)	II, 2	II, 2	III, 2	III, 2	III, 2	III, 2	III, 2	III, 2	III, 2	III, 2
III, 4		II, 1-2	II, 1-2	cf. III, 1-2	cf. III, 1-2	cf. III, 1-2	III, 3	III, 3	III, 3	III, 3	III, 3
III, 5							III, 4	III, 4	III, 4	III, 4	III, 4
IV	4	III	III	IV	IV	IV	III, 5	III, 5	III, 5	III, 5	III, 5
V	5	IV	IV	V	V	V	IV	IV	IV	V	V
VI	6(1-2)	V	V	VI	VI	VI	V	V	V	V	V
VII, 1(a)	6(3)						VI	VI	VI	VI	VI
VII, 1(b)	cf. 7(2) [d]	VI, 1-3, 5	VI, 1	VII, 1	VII, 1(a)	VII, 1(a)	VII, 1(a)	VII, 1(a)	VII, 1(a)	VII, 1(a)	VII, 1(a)
VII, 2(a)	cf. 7(2) [a]	VI, 2-3	VI, 4	VII, 3	VII, 1(b)	VII, 1(b)	VII, 1(b)	VII, 1(b)	VII, 1(b)	VII, 1(b)	VII, 1(b)
		VI, 2-3	VI, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2(a)	VII, 2(a)	VII, 2(a)

¹ The final printed text, signed on 19 June 1951, was distributed as D-D(51) 138(F). This text is reproduced at p. 13. The text contained in D-D(51) 138 (1 June 1951) is identical with the final text with the exceptions noted in D-D(51) 138. *Parallel references in this table do not necessarily indicate that the texts are identical, but only that the same subject matter is treated in the Article or paragraph referred to.*

Final Text	Brussels Stat.	D-D (51) 23	MS-D (51) 5	MS-D (51) 9	MS-D (51) 11	MS-D (51) 11 (R)	MS-D (51) 11 (2R)	D-D (51) 57	MS-D (51) 28	D-D (51) 127	D-D (51) 138
6/19/1951	12/21/1949	1/23/1951	2/12/1951	2/16/1951	2/19/1951	2/20/1951	2/24/1951	2/28/1951	4/27/1951	5/7/1951	6/1/1951
VII, 2(b)		VI, 2-3	VI, 4		VII, 3	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2(b)	VII, 2(b)	VII, 2(b)
VII, 2(c)		VI, 2(c)	VI, 2		VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2	VII, 2(c)	VII, 2(c)	VII, 2(c)
VII, 3(a)	cf.7(2) [c]	VI, 2-3	VI, 4		VII, 3	VII, 3(a)	VII, 3(a)	VII, 3(a)	VII, 3(a)	VII, 3(a)	VII, 3(a)
VII, 3(b)	cf.7(2) [a, c]	VI, 2-3	VI, 5		VII, 4	VII, 3(b)	VII, 3(b)	VII, 3(b)	VII, 3(b)	VII, 3(b)	VII, 3(b)
VII, 3(c)	cf.7(2) [b-c]	VI, 2-3	VI, 4-5		VII, 3-4	VII, 3(c)	VII, 3(c)	VII, 3(c)	VII, 3(c)	VII, 3(c)	VII, 3(c)
VII, 4									VII, 4	VII, 4	VII, 4
VII, 5(a)	7(4), 7(5) (b)	VI, 8	VI, 6		VII, 6	VII, 5	VII, 5	VII, 5(a)	VII, 6(a)	VII, 5(a)	VII, 5(a)
VII, 5(b)	cf.7(4)	VI, 3	VI, 5		VII, 4	VII, 5	VII, 5	VII, 5(b)	VII, 6(b)	VII, 5(b)	VII, 5(b)
VII, 5(c)	cf.7(4), 7(5) (b)					VII, 5	VII, 5	VII, 5(c)	VII, 6(c)	VII, 5(c)	VII, 5(c)
VII, 6(a)	7(3)	VI, 8	VI, 6		VII, 6	VII, 6	VII, 6	VII, 6(a)	VII, 7(a)	VII, 6(a)	VII, 6(a)
VII, 6(b)					VII, 6	VII, 6	VII, 6	VII, 6(b)	VII, 7(b)	VII, 6(b)	VII, 6(b)
VII, 7(a)					VII, 1	VII, 4	VII, 4	VII, 4	VII, 5	VII, 7(a)	VII, 7(a)
VII, 7(b)									VII, 6(d)	VII, 7(b)	VII, 7(b)
VII, 8			VI (Add.)		VII, 5	VII, 7	VII, 7	VII, 7	VII, 8	VII, 8	VII, 8
VII, 9		VI, 4	VI, 7		VII, 7	VII, 8	VII, 8	VII, 8	VII, 9	VII, 9	VII, 9
VII, 10	7(5) (a-b, d)	VI, 9	VI, 8		VII, 8	VII, 9	VII, 9	VII, 9	VII, 10	VII, 10	VII, 10
	7(5) (c)										
VII, 11		VI, 7	VI, 9		VII, 9	VII, 10	VII, 10	VII, 10	VII, 11	VII, 11	VII, 11
VIII, 1	cf.8(2)	cf.VII(3)			VIII, 1	VIII, 1	VIII, 1	VIII, 1(a)	VIII, 1	VIII, 1	VIII, 1
VIII, 2(a)	8(6)	cf.VII, 3			VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2(a)	VIII, 2(a)	VIII, 2(a)

Parallel Table for Texts of SOFA 1—Continued

Final Text	Brussels Stat. 12/21/ 1949	D-D (51) 23 1/23/1951	MS-D (51)5 2/12/ 1951	MS-D (51)9 2/16/1951	MS-D (51)11 2/19/1951	MS-D (51) 11(R) 2/20/1951	MS-D (51) 11(2R) 2/24/1951	D-D (51)57 2/28/1951	MS-D (51)28 4/27/1951	D-D (51)127 5/7/1951	D-D (51)138 6/1/1951
6/19/1951											
VIII, 2(b)	8(6)					VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2(b)	VIII, 2(b)	VIII, 2(b)
VIII, 2(c)									VIII, 2(c)	VIII, 2(c)	VIII, 2(c)
VIII, 2(d)	cf.8(3, 6)								VIII, 2(d)	VIII, 2(d)	VIII, 2(d)
VIII, 2(e)									VIII, 2(e)	VIII, 2(e)	VIII, 2(e)
VIII, 2(f)	cf.8(6)					VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2	VIII, 2(f)	VIII, 2(f)	VIII, 2(f)
VIII, 3						VIII, 1	VIII, 1	VIII, 1(b)	VIII, 3	VIII, 3	VIII, 3
VIII, 4	cf.8(2) (b)	VII, 4				VIII, 3	VIII, 3	VIII, 3	VIII, 4	VIII, 4	VIII, 4
VIII, 5	cf.8 (1, 3, 6)	cf.VII, 1, 2, 5				VIII, 4	VIII, 4	VIII, 4	VIII, 5	VIII, 5	VIII, 5
VIII, 5(a)	cf.8(1)	VII, 2				VIII, 4(a)	VIII, 4(a)	VIII, 4(a)	VIII, 5(a)	VIII, 5(a)	VIII, 5(a)
VIII, 5(b)		VII, 2				VIII, 4(b)	VIII, 4(b)	VIII, 4(b)	VIII, 5(b)	VIII, 5(b)	VIII, 5(b)
VIII, 5(c)		VII, 2				VIII, 4(c)	VIII, 4(c)	VIII, 4(c)	VIII, 5(c)	VIII, 5(c)	VIII, 5(c)
VIII, 5(d)									VIII, 5(d)	VIII, 5(d)	VIII, 5(d)
VIII, 5(e)	cf.8(3, 4)					VIII, 4(e)	VIII, 4(e)	VIII, 4(e)	VIII, 5(e)	VIII, 5(e)	VIII, 5(e)
VIII, 5(e) (i)								VIII, 4(e)(i)	VIII, 5(e)(i)	VIII, 5(e)(i)	VIII, 5(e)(i)
VIII, 5(e) (ii)								VIII, 4(e)(ii)	VIII, 5(e)(ii)	VIII, 5(e)(ii)	VIII, 5(e)(ii)
VIII, 5(e) (iii)									VIII, 5(e)(iii)	VIII, 5(e)(iii)	VIII, 5(e)(iii)
VIII, 5(e) (iv)								VIII, 4(e)(iii)	VIII, 5(e)(iv)	VIII, 5(e)(iv)	VIII, 5(e)(iv)

Final Text	Brussels Stat. 12/21/1949	D-D(51) 23 1/23/1951	MS-D (51)5 2/12/1951	MS-D (51)9 2/16/1951	MS-D (51)11 2/19/1951	MS-D (51) 11(R) 2/20/1951	MS-D (51) 11(2R) 2/24/1951	D-D (51)57 2/28/1951	MS-D (51)28 4/27/1951	D-D (51)127 5/7/1951	D-D (51)138 6/1/1951
X, 2		IX				X, 2	X, 2	X, 2	X, 2	X, 2	X, 2
X, 3								X, 3	X, 3	X, 3	X, 3
X, 4								X, 4	X, 4	X, 4	X, 4
XI, 1	13(1)	X, 1	X, 1	X, 1	XI, 1	XI, 1	XI, 1	XI, 1	XI, 1	XI, 1	XI, 1
XI, 2	13(2)	X, 2	X, 2	X, 2	XI, 2	XI, 2	XI, 2	XI, 2	XI, 2	XI, 2	XI, 2
XI, 3	13(3)	X, 3	X, 3	X, 3	XI, 3	XI, 3	XI, 3	XI, 3	XI, 3	XI, 3	XI, 3
XI, 4	13(4)	X, 4	X, 4	X, 4	XI, 4	XI, 4	XI, 4	XI, 4	XI, 4	XI, 4	XI, 4
XI, 5		X, 4	X, 5	X, 5	XI, 5	XI, 5	XI, 5	1, 5	XI, 5	XI, 5	XI, 5
XI, 6	12(1)(b)	X, 4	X, 6	X, 6	XI, 6	XI, 6	XI, 6	XI, 6	XI, 6	XI, 6	XI, 6
XI, 7	13(4)	IX, 1(b)	X, 7	X, 7	XI, 7	XI, 7	XI, 7	XI, 7	XI, 7	XI, 7	XI, 7
XI, 8	13(5)	X, 5	X, 8	X, 8	XI, 8	XI, 8	XI, 8	XI, 8	XI, 8	XI, 8	XI, 8
XI, 9	13(6)	X, 6	X, 9	X, 9	XI, 9	XI, 9	XI, 9	XI, 9	XI, 9	XI, 9	XI, 9
XI, 10	13(7)	X, 7	X, 10	X, 10	XI, 10	XI, 10	XI, 10	XI, 10	XI, 10	XI, 10	XI, 10
XI, 11	13(8)	X, 8	X, 11	X, 11	XI, 11	XI, 11	XI, 11	XI, 11	XI, 11	XI, 11	XI, 11
XI, 12			X, 12	X, 12	XI, 12	XI, 12	XI, 12	XI, 12	XI, 12	XI, 12	XI, 12
XI, 13									XI, 13	XI, 13	XI, 13
XII	14	XI	XI	XI	XII	XII	XII	XII	XII	XII	XII
XIII, 1	15(1)	XII, 1	XII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1	XIII, 1
XIII, 2	15(2)	XII, 2	XII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2	XIII, 2
XIII, 3	15(3)	XII, 3	XII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3	XIII, 3
XIII, 4	15(4)	XIII	XII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4	XIII, 4
XIV	16	XIII	XIII	XIV	XIV	XIV	XIV	XIV	XIV	XIV	XIV
XV, 1		c.f. VI, 10						XV, 1	XV, 1	XV, 1	XV, 1
XV, 2	17	XIV						XV, 2	XV, 2	XV, 2	XV, 2
XVI	18	XV				XV	XVI	XVI	XVI	XVI	XVI

Parallel Tables for Texts of CIVA ¹

Final Text	D-D (51)58	MS-D (51)24	MS-D (51)25	MS-D (51)29	MS-D(51) 29(R)	MS-D(51) 29(2R)
9/20/1951	3/1/1951	4/16/1951	4/20/1951	5/5/1951	6/11/1951	6/15/1951
Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title
Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble
Part I	I	I	I	I	I	I
Part II	II-IV, VIII	II-III	II-IV	II-IV	II	II
Part III	V, VIII		V	V	III	III
Part IV	VI-VIII		VI-VII	VI-VII	IV	IV
Part V	IX		VIII	VIII	V	V
Part VI	X		IX	IX	VI	VI
Part VII	XI		X	X	VII	VII
1(a)		1(a)	1(a)	1(a)	1(a)	1(a)
1(b)	1(a)	1(b)		1(b)	1(b)	1(b)
1(c)	1(b)	1(c)	1(b)	1(c)	1(c)	1(c)
	1(c)	1(d)				
1(d)						1(d)
			2			
2			3			2
3	2	2	4	2	2	2
4	3[1]	3[1]	5(1)	3	3	3
	3[2]	3[2]	5(2)	4	4	4
5	4	4	6			
6	5	5	7	5	5	5
7	6	6	8	6	6	6
8	7	7	9	7	7	7
9	8	8	10	8	8	8
10	9	9	11	9	9	9
			12	10	10	10
				11		11(1)
						11(2)
11	10		13	12	11	12
12	cf.11-12		14	13	12	13
13(1)	11-12; cf.18		15(1)	14(1)	13(1)	14(1)
13(2)	13		15(2)	14(2)	13(2)	14(2)
13(3)			15(3)	14(3)	13(3)	14(3)
14			16	15	14	15
16	14		17	16	15	16
16	15		18	17	16	17
17	16		19	18	17	18
18	17		20	19	18	19

¹ The final printed text, signed on 20 September 1951, was distributed as D-D(51) 178(F). This text is reproduced at p. 34, *supra*. The text contained in D-D(51) 178 has been omitted from the parallel tables, since it is identical with the final text except for the following minor variations: (a) The square brackets found in Article 18(b) and 18(d) of D-D(51) 178 are omitted from the final text; and (b) the final text shows Ottawa as the place of signature, with the date as 20 September 1951. *References in the parallel table indicate treatment of the same subject matter in the places referred to, and not necessarily identity of text.*

Parallel Tables for Texts of CIVA ¹—Continued

Final Text	D-D (51)58	MS-D (51)24	MS-D (51)25	MS-D (51)29	MS-D (51)29(R)	MS-D(51)29(2R)
9/20/1951	3/1/1951	4/16/1951	4/20/1951	5/5/1951	6/11/1951	6/15/1951
	18					
19	cf.17(b)		cf.20(b)	cf.19(b)	cf.18(b)	cf.19(b)
20			21	20	19	20
21(1)	20		23	22	20(1)	21(1)
21(2)					20(2)	21(2)
22	19, 21		22, 24	21, 23	21	22
	22					
23					22	23
24	23		25	24	23	24
25	24		26	25	24	25
26	25		27	26	25	26
27						

Parallel Table for Texts of PROT 1

Final Text	D-D(51) 300	D-D(51) 300(R)	MS-D (52)3	D-D (52)27	MS-D (52)6	MS-D (51)6(R)
8/28/1952	12/12/1951	1/3/1952	1/18/1952	1/23/1952	3/27/1952	5/5/1952
Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title	Title
Preamble			Preamble	Preamble	Preamble	Preamble
1(a)	2(a)	2(a)	1(a)	1(a)	1(a)	1(a)
1(b)	cf.2(b-d)	cf.2(b-d)	1(b)	1(b)	1(b)	1(b)
1(c)	cf.2(b-d)	cf.2(b-d)	1(c)	1(c)	1(c)	1(c)
1(d)				1(d)	1(d)	1(d)
2	1	1	2	2	2	2
3(1) (a)			3(a)	3(a)	3(1) (a)	3(1) (a)
3(1) (b)			3(b)	3(b)	3(1) (b)	3(1) (b)
3(1) (c)				3(c)	3(1) (c)	3(1) (c)
3(2)						8
	3(a)	3(a)				
4[1] (a)	cf.3(b)	cf.3(b)	4(a)	4(a)	4(a)	4[1] (a)
4[1] (b)	cf.3(b)	cf.3(b)	4(b)	4(b)	4(b)	4[1] (b)
4[1] (c)	cf.3(b)	cf.3(b)	4(c)	4(c)	4(c)	4[1] (c)
4[1] (d)	cf.3(b)	cf.3(b)		4(d)	4(d)	4[1] (d)
4[2]	cf.3(b)	cf.3(b)			4(d)	4[2]
5	4	4	5	5	5	5
			6	6	6	6
6(1)						
6(2) (a)						7(1) (a)
6(2) (b)						7(1) (b)
6(2) (c)						7(1) (c)
6(3)						7(2)
	5	5				
7(1)			7	7	7(1-2)	9(1)
7(2)						9(2)
8(1)					8(1)	10(1)
8(2)					8(2)	10(2)
8(3)						10(3)
8(4)					8(3)	10(4)
9(a)					9(1)	11(1)
9(b)	6	6			9(2)	11(2)
10	7	7	8	8	10	12
11(1)	8	8	9(1)	9(1)	11(1)	13(1)
11(2)	8	8	9(2)	9(2)	11(2)	13(2)
12(1)	9(a)	9(a)	10(1)	10(1)	12(1)	14(1)
12(2)	9(b)	9(b)	10(2)	10(2)	12(2)	14(2)
13	10	10	11	11	13	15

¹ The final printed text, signed on 28 August 1952, was distributed as C-M(52) 30(F). This text is reproduced at p. 43, *supra*. The text contained in C-M(52) 30 (7 June 1952) has been omitted from the parallel tables, since it is identical with the final text except for the following minor variations: (a) The words "and for their official and exclusive benefit" do not appear in Article 8, paragraph 1, of C-M(52) 30; and (2) the draft Protocol, C-M(52) 30, does not contain the date of signature nor the actual signatures. *The parallel references indicate treatment of the same subject matter in the place referred to, and not necessarily identity of text.*

Parallel Table for Texts of PROT¹—Continued

Final Text	D-D(51) 300	D-D(51) 300(R)	MS-D (52)3	D-D (52)57	MS-D (52)6	MS-D (52)6(R)
8/28/1952	12/12/1951	1/3/1952	1/18/1952	1/23/1952	3/27/1952	5/5/1952
	11	11				
		12				
14(1)				12	14(1)	16(1)
14(2)					14(2)	16(2)
15			12	13	15	17
16(1)	12-13	13-14	13(1)	14(1)	16(1)	18(1)
16(2)	12	13	13(2)	14(2)	16(2)	18(2)

