

Chinese Intelligence Operations

E. D. Smith Jr.

Nicholas Eftimiades

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digital-commons.usnwc.edu/nwc-review>

Recommended Citation

Smith, E. D. Jr. and Eftimiades, Nicholas () "Chinese Intelligence Operations," *Naval War College Review*: Vol. 48 : No. 2 , Article 20.
Available at: <http://digital-commons.usnwc.edu/nwc-review/vol48/iss2/20>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at U.S. Naval War College Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Naval War College Review by an authorized editor of U.S. Naval War College Digital Commons. For more information, please contact daniel.desilets@usnwc.edu.

148 Naval War College Review

formula of "one country, two systems." However, Taiwan and Hong Kong are the two indispensable channels for foreign capital and technologies flowing into China. It was the intent of Lin and Robinson neither to conceptualize the term "greater China" nor to provide a definitive answer to whether there will be a "greater China." This book does provide, however, a better understanding of the factors that may affect the nature and direction of the relationship between China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong.

It took the editors three years to get their then-timely observations to publication. Since the conference, the Washington-Moscow-Beijing strategic triangle terminated with the disintegration of the Soviet Union. Taipei and Beijing have set up semiofficial agencies for bilateral negotiations, and the Chinese Communist Party has carried out several major political-military leadership reshuffles, beginning with its Fourteenth Party Congress in 1992.

Even with the editors' considerable efforts at revision, the book still fails to offer sufficient updated information regarding the developments in the three Chinese societies. Therefore, for China experts and policy makers, the value of this long-overdue material is somewhat reduced. However, the merit and integrity of each essay remain solid, and this book will serve as a useful reference for a general readership as well as for students in their contemplation of contemporary Chinese affairs.

Deng Xiaoping, China's paramount leader, just celebrated his ninetieth birthday; Hong Kong has less than one thousand days before it is formally

returned to Beijing's rule; and Taiwan is conducting an all-out operation to win international recognition. Given these rapid changes in the "greater China," the editors may want to organize another international conference on the same subject, or begin working on a revised edition of this important book.

ALEXANDER C. HUANG
Washington, D.C.

Eftimiades, Nicholas. *Chinese Intelligence Operations*. Annapolis, Md.: Naval Institute Press, 1994. 169pp. (No price given)

This timely book discusses the widespread and expanding espionage operations of the People's Republic of China, the PRC. The author is an Asia specialist and an analyst in the Defense Intelligence Agency's counterintelligence assessment branch; thus, he is amply qualified to address this topic. In addition, his assessments are based in part on interviews of many Chinese dissidents, defectors, and active intelligence officers, which lends his work a credibility not normally found in academic assessments of intelligence operations.

Eftimiades briefly describes China's evolving intelligence needs, focusing on the two central requirements: for intelligence on security threats (internal and external) and for the acquisition of foreign technology. He then shifts to a discussion of Chinese foreign and domestic human source intelligence (HUMINT) operations and how they are organized. Over half of this book has been dedicated to describing the Chinese intelligence

bureaucracy, reflecting, perhaps, the author's area of personal expertise.

He describes in some detail the two largest intelligence organizations in China, the Ministry of State Security and the Military Intelligence Department of the Chinese army's General Staff Department. Both of these intelligence organs are augmented by a wide variety of other nonintelligence organizations that conduct espionage abroad under semiofficial cover. They include such organizations as the Commission of Science, Technology and Industry for National Defense (COSTIND) and the various military research and strategic studies institutes. COSTIND is both a consumer of intelligence, assigning tasks to the other intelligence agencies on issues of technology, and a collector of intelligence, sending scientific delegations on "scholarly exchanges" around the world to collect and identify new technologies having military applications.

These and other examples demonstrate what the author believes to be a unique characteristic of Chinese intelligence operations: the extensive use of commercial, academic, and illegal or nonofficial covers of espionage. Such operations are risky to the participants, but Eftimiades points out that by focusing on the acquisition of mid-level rather than state-of-the-art technology, the Chinese decrease both the chance of exposure and the likely penalties for their agents if caught.

The overarching concern of the Chinese Communist Party for its own security is well illustrated in the author's chapter on domestic operations and in two Chinese documents that appear as

appendices. The documents were provided by a recent defector from the PRC embassy and discuss internal Chinese policy regarding Chinese students overseas. These documents reflect a sophisticated understanding of the need to maintain close surveillance on the activities of Chinese students abroad and to identify and punish dissidents. Both are chilling reminders that despite its appearance of openness the Chinese government remains a totalitarian dictatorship, concerned most with its own survival.

The author concludes that the vastness of the Chinese intelligence bureaucracy and the omnipresence of its operators combine to make the Chinese intelligence services highly inefficient. Whatever successes they have achieved, according to the author, stem from limitations of the Western intelligence and counterintelligence services rather than any sophistication on the Chinese part. Despite what he considers to be their mediocre track record to date, Eftimiades expects that the intelligence operations of the Chinese will become more sophisticated as they gain experience.

This work provides an interesting and unique addition to the literature available on this topic. It is not the overview of Chinese intelligence operations that its title suggests but rather is focused in large part on bureaucratic organization and human intelligence. It does not discuss, even in outline, such other technical sources as satellite imagery, signals intelligence, etc. Furthermore, the author's negative evaluation of China's human intelligence capability seems to ignore the implications of what was arguably the most successful

Chinese espionage operation against the U.S. yet exposed, that of longtime CIA employee Larry Wu-Tai Chin.

With these limitations in mind, this book provides an excellent overview of China's use of espionage in support of its global interests. The best primer for understanding the philosophy behind Chinese intelligence operations is still Sun Tzu's *Art of War*. More recent works have examined the historical development of China's intelligence services. Books such as Flaigot and Kauffer's *The Chinese Secret Service* (William Morrow, 1987) and Richard Deacon's *The Chinese Secret Service* (Taplinger, 1974) focus more on personalities than on organizations. Eftimiades' study adds to our understanding of Chinese intelligence by describing how China's intelligence bureaucracy is organized and by identifying the groups that constitute extensions of that organization. He has done a real service to the national security community.

E.D. SMITH, JR.
 Captain, U.S. Navy, Ret.
 Portsmouth, Rhode Island

Breuille, John, ed. *The State of Germany: The National Idea in the Making, Unmaking, and Remaking of a Modern Nation-State*. New York: Longman, 1992. 243pp. (No price given)

Jackson, Robert J., ed. *Europe in Transition: The Management of Security After the Cold War*. New York: Praeger, 1992. 224pp. \$47.95

The collapse of communism in eastern Europe and, in particular, the 1989

reunification of Germany overturned political arrangements in Europe that had been remarkably stable for over four decades. The basic security structures and underlying principles that had driven European policy went generally unquestioned among politicians, academics, and analysts alike, for virtually none of them foresaw the scope of the changes or the astonishing speed with which they would occur.

The shattering of the old European bipolar security paradigm has reopened many fundamental questions. Among the most important is the renewed "German Question"—namely, how a disproportionately powerful central European state can prosper and at the same time be a threat to its neighbors. Will Germany continue its pre-1989 support for an increasingly unified Europe, or will a more "purely German" policy emerge as a consequence of Germany's reunification, conflicts in eastern Europe, increased growth of nationalism, and the growing skepticism toward a "United Europe"?

John Breuille, a lecturer in history at the University of Manchester, England, argues that understanding both the past and present nature of Germany is central to addressing the "German Question." *The State of Germany* is based on a collection of talks given by several academics about various historical periods of Germany. The conference was held during the 1989–1990 academic year and was supported by the Goethe Institute of Manchester and the University of Manchester. Breuille asked the speakers to address two questions: "What was meant by ideas such as