

1977

The Chinese Communist Party In Power, 1949-1976

Allan B. Cole

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digital-commons.usnwc.edu/nwc-review>

Recommended Citation

Cole, Allan B. (1977) "The Chinese Communist Party In Power, 1949-1976," *Naval War College Review*: Vol. 30 : No. 3 , Article 18.
Available at: <https://digital-commons.usnwc.edu/nwc-review/vol30/iss3/18>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at U.S. Naval War College Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Naval War College Review by an authorized editor of U.S. Naval War College Digital Commons. For more information, please contact repository.inquiries@usnwc.edu.

commander who merely acts as a "post-office," relaying to subordinates an unlawful order received from above, would have no defense if he were aware of the unlawfulness of the order. This is undoubtedly correct if we can rely on the post-World War II cases involving the transmittal of such orders.

The author properly points out that there is a general and erroneous tendency to regard war crimes trials as "victor's justice," something to which members of the victor's own armed forces are not subjected, although individual members thereof may be just as guilty as the members of the defeated enemy's armed forces who are tried. As he indicates, the victor's personnel are tried under national law and without publicity. Few members of the American public could name anyone but Calley as having been tried by a U.S. court-martial for an offense which, although charged as an offense under national law, would be a war crime from the point of view of international law; but such trials have been held in most wars.

Two final notes: The author places considerable reliance on a lesson plan which was prepared at the Army JAG School for the use of its instructors, referring to its contents as indicative of the attitude of "the United States military authorities." I am sure that the personnel of the JAG School would be the first to admit that such a document represented nothing more than the views of the then School authorities. It *might* represent U.S. military doctrine—but it might not. And, the Dutch publisher, Sijthoff, has produced yet another volume with the footnotes hidden at the end of each chapter where the reader can locate them only after a frustrating and time-consuming procedure. Certainly, reasonably inexpensive methods exist, or could be devised, whereby the footnotes would be more readily available to the reader. It is particularly unfortunate that such an

excellent and informative volume as that of Professor Green must suffer under this infirmity, since this study is unquestionably one which should be owned by everyone with a concern for or an interest in military law or the law of war.

HOWARD S. LEVIE
Saint Louis University Law School

Guillermaz, Jacques. *The Chinese Communist Party In Power, 1949-1976*. Trans. by Anne Destenay. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press, 1976. 614pp.

The West, someday the world, is and will be indebted to this senior French historian, with considerable experience in China, for this judiciously interpretative survey of mainland China since the Communist Party attained national power. It is the sequel to his already well-respected *A History of the Chinese Communist Party, 1921-1949* (London: Methuen; New York: Random House, 1972).

In his foreword the author explains his purpose: "... I have tried as far as possible to adopt a viewpoint situated within the Chinese system... [not to justify but] to share the ideas and reasoning of its leaders and to understand the feelings and the behavior of the masses." Actually he is more objective than this deeply felt sympathy and admiration has permitted in some others. He accords their due to the CCP, its leaders and cadres, the new institutions and the people while not falling into the uncritical euphoria of the wishful or unprincipled.

The treatment is divided into four parts: The first dealing with the consolidation of the new regime, 1949-53; then the period of the First Five-Year Plan, 1953-57; followed by the Great Leap Forward, communization and readjustments (1958-62); finally a 244-page analysis of the Socialist Educational Campaign, the Cultural Revolution, and

142 NAVAL WAR COLLEGE REVIEW

developments from then into 1976. Main emphasis is on political history with considerable attention to factions, ideological views and economic policies. Chapters are usually short and moderately documented. Those on cultural topics and on foreign affairs are succinct, interpretative summations. Professor Guillermaz's analyses of Sino-Soviet relations have more depth, though they cannot provide commentary on each set of statements or actions. On pages 324-330 one finds a very thoughtful summary of Sino-Soviet issues and divergent interests, with non-partisan emphasis on Chinese positions and rationale. In the longer run, the reviewer is a little skeptical of "points of no return" in relations between states. With respect to the U.S.S.R. and the PRC, this author chooses the period 1962-63; some others would date this from the summer of 1959. Truth probably is: In such a complex development, there was no one focal "point."

Professor Guillermaz found reason in China's agricultural preponderance for devoting much attention to problems of that agrarian economy and society. Perceptively he explains the processes and adjustments during communization, and he provides one of the clearest available descriptions of the three-level reallocation of functions after 1960. Perhaps more could have been included about the implications of these changes for the communes as political entities.

To illustrate the profundity of this writer's insights at numerous points in the book, I shall quote from just one passage concerning serious disturbances during the Cultural Revolution (p. 428):

Anarchism was primarily the result of the inability of the "revolutionary rebels" to gain a firm foothold everywhere and at every level. It varied in intensity and was generally tempered by the inherent characteristics of an ancient society that was accustomed to doing without authority

in times of crisis and based its inner order on morality and customs, and also by the Chinese distaste for extremes. Where any other country would inevitably have slid into a state of generalized, relentless civil war, China fell back on the traditional reflexes of prudence and discretion.

How could a general work satisfy everyone in every respect? Highly as this reader can recommend the book, he notices a few subjects or interpretations that could have been included. There might have been clearer indications of Chinese nationalistic, hard bargaining with Soviet leaders during the years 1950-54. In Chapter 12 more could have been written about the Hundred Flowers episode as a pressure for rectification of cadre styles. Also, some of the antirevisionist arguments and rhetoric of the Anti-Rightist Movement of 1957 reflected the contentions with Soviet ideologues that were already underway in dialogues that had not yet become quite hostile. There is some suggestion, but no clear concept conveyed, of the ways in which Party organs encroached laterally on state administrative (including statistical) functions at most levels during the Great Leap. On page 440 the chance is missed to mention the disorders that occurred in Hong Kong during one phase of the Cultural Revolution. And, though I know why China specialists are tempted to depict Chinese culture and circumstances as unique, I am not sure that there are not analytical gains to be made by the comparison of China's experience with other modernizing and revolutionary patterns. For example, no one overlooks the holistic character of Marxism-Leninism-Maoism, but one is not sure whether Professor Guillermaz views Confucianism as a consummatory system of thought.

On the other hand, as indicated above, there are many illuminating passages in this book: the author's comment on the Great Leap (p. 211);

his analysis of the fall of Lin Piao (p. 463); his summary interpretation of the Cultural Revolution (pp. 464-468); and others. The volume ends with a carefully selected bibliography and a fairly detailed index.

ALLAN B. COLE

The Fletcher School of Law & Diplomacy

Gwynn, Julian. *The Royal Navy and North America: The Warren Papers, 1736-1752*. London: Navy Records Society, 1973. v. 118. 463pp.

Dr. Gwynn's edition of the Warren papers is an outgrowth of his Oxford D.Phil. thesis which was published in Canada under the title *The Enterprising Admiral: The Personal Fortune of Admiral Sir Peter Warren* (Montreal, 1974). The documents in this Navy Records Society volume are taken from Warren's previously unpublished, official and private correspondence.

Although Warren's abiding concern for prize money is apparent from these documents, this aspect is not stressed to the degree which it was in Dr. Gwynn's first book. In the documents, the reader will find Warren's views on strategy and force deployment, his political ambitions and the problems he faced in leadership and management of the squadron on the North American station during the War of the Austrian Succession.

This collection has been drawn from many sources in America and in England. It relates entirely to Warren's service on the North American station, most notably in the siege of Louisbourg in 1745 and subsequently as governor of the colony of Cape Breton. Geographically limited in this way, the volume will have its greatest appeal to readers in the United States and Canada. However, the general reader of 18th-century history will find Parts II, III and IV, in particular, to be such a close interchange of letters that little prior knowledge is necessary. An excellent intro-

duction and an appendix of thumbnail sketches on each person mentioned in the documents provides a valuable overview and detailed background information. Two specially drawn maps and some well-chosen portraits and views directly complement the documents. While this correspondence does not have the literary merit which one might generally associate with the Augustan Age and "Dr. Johnson's England," there is a great appeal in a sailor's bluff, forthright manner of expression. There is much to be learned from it about 18th-century life and society.

The general reader will face one disadvantage: Many, but not all the relevant documents are printed in this volume. There are noticeable gaps in the exchange of letters. While this is a serious disadvantage to the unity of the book, it is, in this case, an advantage to the scholar. The editor has assiduously noted the letters which he has been unable to find, and in a lengthy appendix, he has listed chronologically the Warren papers of related interest which are published elsewhere. This cross-index to 16 different publications is a valuable tool, in itself, which will benefit specialists in American colonial history as well as the naval scholars for whom it is intended.

There is little doubt that this volume will stand as one of the best that the Navy Records Society has produced. In form and scholarship, it is a model of its kind.

JOHN B. HATTENDORF
Pembroke College, Oxford

Hezlet, Sir Arthur. *Electronics and Sea Power*. New York: Stein and Day, 1975. 317pp.

Sir Arthur Hezlet has expanded his subject from its original inspiration—the effect of the discovery of electromagnetic radiation on naval warfare—to include all electrical and electronic devices used at sea, including sonar. This